

Proof-by-Contradiction and Proof-by-Contraposition

Proof-by-Contradiction

To Prove: Statement p .

Proof: (by Contradiction)

Suppose $\sim p$.

∴ q

∴ $\sim q$

∴ $q \wedge \sim q$ ("This is a contradiction.")

∴ p , by proof-by-contradiction. QED

Task:

[Suppose $\sim p$]

[∴ q]

[∴ $\sim q$]

[∴ $q \wedge \sim q$]

[∴ p]

Comments about Proof-by-Contradiction:

- 1.) An explicit statement that a contradiction has been reached is required:

Example: Assume that, earlier in the proof, it was pointed out that $\frac{1}{2}$ is not an integer.

Assume that now it has just been established that $\frac{1}{2}$ is an integer.

You can state: "Therefore, $\frac{1}{2}$ is not an integer and $\frac{1}{2}$ is an integer, which is a contradiction."

Or, you can state: "Therefore, $\frac{1}{2}$ is an integer, which contradicts the fact that $\frac{1}{2}$ is not an integer."

Notice that this second wording combines the [∴ $\sim q$] task and the [∴ $q \wedge \sim q$] task into one sentence.

Thus, a proof-by-contradiction requires the use of one of the terms "contradicts" or "contradiction".

- 2.) After arriving at a contradiction, you must immediately conclude the negation of the supposition.
- 3.) You are not allowed to start a proof-by-contradiction with the phrase "Suppose not."
Instead, you must "Suppose" the explicit wording of the negation of the statement to be proved.
- 4.) Use "Proof-by-Contradiction" to prove that something does not exist or that an object does not have a particular property.

Example:

Task

To Prove: There does not exist an integer which is both even and odd.

Proof: (Proof-by-Contradiction)

Suppose there exists an integer n which is both even and odd.

Note, $\frac{1}{2}$ is not an integer.

By definitions of "even" and "odd", there exist integers k and ℓ such that $n = 2k$ and $n = 2\ell + 1$.

∴ $2k = 2\ell + 1$, by substitution. ∴ $2(k - \ell) = 1$. ∴ $(k - \ell) = \frac{1}{2}$.

∴ $\frac{1}{2}$ is an integer since $(k - \ell)$ is an integer.

∴ $\frac{1}{2}$ is an integer and $\frac{1}{2}$ is not an integer, a contradiction

∴ There does not exist an integer which is both even and odd,
by proof-by-contradiction. QED

[Suppose $\sim p$]
[∴ q]

[∴ $\sim q$]

[∴ $q \wedge \sim q$]

[∴ p]

Proof-by-Contraposition:

The method of Proof-by-Contraposition to prove an "If A, Then B" statement involves the writing of a direct proof of its contrapositive statement: "If Not B, Then Not A."

The Design for Proofs of Conditional Statements by Contraposition

To Prove: IF p , THEN q .

Tasks for proving $p \rightarrow q$

Proof: (by Contraposition)

Suppose $\sim q$.

[Suppose $\sim q$]

...

...

$\therefore \sim p$

[$\therefore \sim p$]

[\therefore IF $\sim q$, THEN $\sim p$.] [Optional]

[$\therefore \sim q \rightarrow \sim p$]

\therefore IF p , THEN q , by Contraposition.

[$\therefore p \rightarrow q$]

QED

Proposition 4.5.4: For all integers n , if n^2 is even, then n is even.

Proof: [by Contraposition]

Let n be any integer. [We will prove the statement: "If n is not even, then n^2 is not even."]

Suppose n is not even.

Then, by the Parity Corollary (and by Elimination), n is odd.

Therefore, there exists an integer k such that $n = 2k + 1$.

$\therefore n^2 = (2k + 1)^2$, by substitution,

$$= (4k^2 + 4k) + 1$$

$$= 4(k^2 + k) + 1 = 2(2(k^2 + k)) + 1$$

$$= 2t + 1, \text{ where } t = 2(k^2 + k), \text{ which is an integer.}$$

$\therefore n^2$ is odd, by definition of "odd".

$\therefore n^2$ is not even, since no integer is both even and odd;

[As was proved on the other side of this page]

Therefore, if n^2 is even, then n is even, by proof-by-contraposition.

\therefore For all integers n , if n^2 is even, then n is even, by Direct Proof.

QED